

CITY OF MUSKEGON
HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION
MINUTES

May 7, 2019

Chairperson J. Hilt called the meeting to order at 4:00 p.m. and roll was taken.

MEMBERS PRESENT: J. Hilt, S. Radtke, D. Warren, K. George, L. Wood, K. Panozzo

MEMBERS ABSENT: A. Riegler, excused

STAFF PRESENT: J. Pesch, D. Renkenberger

OTHERS PRESENT: P. Camp, N. Bierenga and L. Olechnowicz from the Greater Muskegon Woman's Club

APPROVAL OF MINUTES

A motion to approve the regular meeting minutes of April 2, 2019 was made by S. Radtke, supported by K. Panozzo and unanimously approved.

NEW BUSINESS

Case 2019-07 – 280 W. Webster Avenue (Roof). Applicant: The Greater Muskegon Woman's Club. District: Downtown Structures. Current Function: Club. J. Pesch presented the staff report. The applicant is seeking approval to remove the clay tile roof, repair and replace damaged roof boards, reinforce joists as needed, place sheathing over roof surface, install new ice and water shield on all eaves and valleys, and install new metal shingles in clay profile. The applicant prepared a presentation for the meeting.

The slide presentation described the Woman's Club and its history. The roof of the building was the first clay roof in Muskegon but it was now 114 years old and needed replacing. Several of the clay tiles were broken or missing. They had been making repairs as best they could over the years but there was now water leakage and damage to the roof structure so they needed to replace it. The clay tiles were extremely heavy and the club members were concerned about the ability of the 114-year-old building to be able to continue to support a clay tile roof. It was also very expensive, with repair estimates coming in at over \$300,000; they brought in a sample of a clay-tile-look metal roofing product that would cost about half as much and weigh much less. Regarding the gutter system, the current one was built into the roof itself and was in poor condition. They would like to sheet over the existing eaves trough and install new functional gutters. K. Panozzo asked if they would be replacing any boards. L. Olechnowicz stated that, based on the last inspection in 2013, they would need to replace several damaged boards. S. Radtke asked if they had looked into having the roof repaired instead of replacing it. L. Olechnowicz thought that there was too much damage to try to replace tiles. The roofing inspector found so many damaged tiles that he stopped documenting the damage in photos after the first several. P. Camp stated that they had replaced individual broken tiles in the past but there were too many now, their supply of replacement tiles was depleted, and the underlying roof structure was also damaged. Pictures of several damaged areas of the roof were provided for board members' review. K. George pointed out that just replacing tiles would not necessarily address the water leaks and underlying damage. S. Radtke asked what the life expectancy was on the metal tiles.

L. Olechnowicz stated that it was 100 years. They requested input from HDC members in choosing between two colors of metal tiles that they had. Board members concurred that the lighter of the two choices presented was preferable.

A motion that the HDC approve the request to remove the clay tile roof, repair and replace roof boards, reinforce joists as needed, place sheathing over roof surface, install new ice and water shield on all eaves and valleys, and install new metal shingles in clay profile using the lighter shade of the two options, as long as the work meets all zoning requirements and the necessary permits are obtained was made by K. Panozzo, supported by L. Wood and approved, with J. Hilt, D. Warren, K. George, and L. Wood voting aye and S. Radtke voting nay.

OTHER

Muskegon Heritage Museum – there has been a large banner-type sign installed on their exterior wall without HDC approval. J. Pesch stated that he would follow up on it.

Hackley Park – J. Pesch mentioned that there may be a group in the near future requesting to install 5' x 5' cement pads and a cement pathway near the Hackley Park stage to place speakers on.

HDC Local Standards Review – The revised local standards for Window, Door, & Exterior Woodwork and Fence incorporating comments from the April meeting were included with the staff report. Staff and board members gave suggestions for the final update.

Holland Regional HDC Training – J. Pesch notified board members that a free regional HDC training opportunity would take place on Wednesday, May 22nd from 6:00 – 8:30pm in Holland, and he explained how to register for it at <https://southwestmichiganhdctraining2019.eventbrite.com>. He encouraged board members to attend if they were able.

There being no further business, the meeting was adjourned at 5:03 p.m.